

# **APPENDIX 7.1: SECURITY SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM UPGRADE PROJECT**

## **– RFI EVALUATION REPORT**

### **1. Introduction**

The Board took a decision to issue a formal Request for Information (RFI) with the purpose of obtaining insights regarding the solution for the integrated CCTV Surveillance Camera System for the Estate of our size and detailed indicative costing.

Furthermore, the service providers were requested to include the proposals for the Electric Fence and Perimeter Lighting solutions with associated costing, so that the Board could determine if there were providers who could offer end-to-end (comprehensive) solution that covers the aforementioned areas (i.e., CCTV, Electric Fence and Perimeter Lighting solutions). The service providers were requested to supply company details, B-BBBEE Certificate, SARS Certificate, which contributed to the shortlisting process.

### **2. Enquiry Process**

The RFI was e-mailed to Thirteen (13) service providers known to supply the required services on Sunday, 3 October 2021. Two additional service providers were allowed to respond to the RFI after receiving the information through alternative means such the referrals. The following were companies invited to provide the information:

1. IMC Access
2. Smart Conn Security
3. Fidelity ADT
4. DDL Security Services (Pty) Ltd
5. Bhekabantu Security Services
6. CSG Security
7. PC Maniacs
8. Presak Enterprise
9. Bidvest Protea Coin
10. Remote Off-Site Monitoring
11. Vispro
12. Tokiso Security
13. All Connect Africa

The following companies were allowed to respond to the RFI after being referred by other service providers:

1. RP Electrical and Pools Construction
2. No Limited Projects (Pty) Ltd

The RFI process was opened on the 4<sup>th</sup> October 2021 at 08:00 (local RSA time) and closed on the on 15<sup>th</sup> October 2021 23:59 (local RSA time). Out of the thirteen (13) service providers who were officially invited to provide the information, only nine participated which made the total participation (i.e. responses) to 11, including the two companies that were not part of the formal email sent out (Refer to Annexure A for detailed responses).

### 3. RFI Evaluation Approach

- a. The evaluation process involved the Board of Directors and two HOA members with the level of expertise on the security solutions, namely:
  - Tiego Moroaswi – Director
  - Randy Molai – Director
  - Stephen Kgomo – Director
  - Nhlakanipho Chiliza – Director
  - Johan Botha – Deputy Chairperson of Security Committee
  - Mxolisi Nkomo – Security Equipment Expert
- b. All the RFI participants provided adequate responses which enabled effective evaluation of the CCTV requirement and fell short on the Electric Fencing and Perimeter Lighting. The team took a decision to evaluate the CCTV solution, with a view of issuing separate enquiries for Electric Fencing and Perimeter Lighting solutions.
- c. Companies were evaluated based on functionality (0.7 weighting), price (0.2 weighting) and BEE credential (0.1 weighting).
- d. The committee agreed to shortlist four (4) companies that will be requested to provide the proposals, if the next steps will be a Request for Proposal (RFP) process.

### 4. RFI Evaluation Results

The table provides the list of the recommended top four companies and their weighted scores:

Criteria	Index /10	Weighting	CSG Security	DDL Security Services (Pty) Ltd	Presak Enterprise	Tokiso Security
			Weighted Score	Weighted Score	Weighted Score	Weighted Score
CCTV						
Index used	10					
Monitoring (Onsite and offsite)	8	0,16	1,6	1,12	0,64	0,48
Maintenance	8	0,16	1,28	0,64	0,48	0,48
Coverage	10	0,2	2	1,2	2	1,6
Technology	8	0,16	1,6	1,28	1,28	1,6
System Availability (Power)	10	0,2	0,4	0,4	0,4	1,6
Compatibility (Integration to the existing system)	6	0,12	0,48	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>7,36</b>	<b>4,64</b>	<b>4,8</b>	<b>5,76</b>

BEE (Level 1 - 10, 2 = 8 and None = 0)		0,1	0,8	0,8	1	0
Price (R3m = mean, standard deviation cap)		0,2	2	1,8	1	1,2
Functionality		0,7	5,152	3,248	3,36	4,032
Total Price			R3 000 000	R2 800 000	R4 400 000	R1 800 000
Grand total CCTV			7,952	5,848	5,360	5,232
Ranking			1	2	3	4

## 5. Recommendations

The following ideas were considered:

### a. Sourcing the material directly from distributors:

- HOA to consider sourcing the CCTV material directly from the distributors at discounted price instead of the retailers, resellers and installers.
- We could identify two or three distributors to negotiate with based on the information we obtained from the RFI. The potential benefit of the proposal is high cost saving on the material.

### b. Sourcing of installation, CCTV monitoring and maintenance services from the top 4:

- Extract the relevant specification from the proposals received through RFI process and issue a closed enquiry to the top 4 companies for the installation of the equipment. The payment schedule for the installation will depend on the construction programme.
- The CCTV cameras and associated equipment will be provided to the installation contractor as 'free issue'.
- The scope for the installation contractor will also include provision of off-site monitoring and equipment maintenance services.
- The CCTV monitoring and maintenance contract will be for the maximum of three (3) years, which will be reviewed based on performance.

### c. Sourcing of the fencing and perimeter lighting separately:

- Directors to issue separate RFPs to the service providers that specialises on the electric fencing and perimeter lighting that could have been discouraged by the CCTV scope.
- The scope of the RFPs will be the supply and installation of the relevant infrastructure components.

## 6. Funding Proposal

The Board recommends the following:

Item	Proposed funding mechanism	Costing based on the four shortlisted (Average)	Estimated cost when procuring directly from the distributor (Less 25% markup)	Estimated Savings
Material	Capital Expenditure (CapEx) - paid from the investment account in order to provide a relief for the levy increase	R832 534.00 <i>(Price: lowest = R382 908.00 and highest = R1 654 231.00)</i>	R733 564	R183 391.00
Installation	Capital Expenditure - paid from the investment account in order to provide a relief for the levy increase	R305 897.00 <i>(Price: lowest = R65 771.00.00 and highest = R770 950.00)</i>	Negotiate installation with the reasonable service provider	To be determined upon the negotiation outcomes
Support and maintenance	Operational Expenditure (OpEx) – to be funded through operational cash on a monthly basis	R24 511.00 <i>(Price: lowest = R17 150.00 and highest = R31 764.00)</i>	Negotiate support and maintenance with the reasonable service provider	To be determined upon the negotiation outcomes
Monitoring	Operational Expenditure (OpEx) - to be funded through operational cash on a monthly basis	R6 500.00 <i>(Price: lowest = R2 350.00 and highest = R17 150.00)</i>	Negotiate monitoring with the reasonable service provider	To be determined upon the negotiation outcomes
<b>Total Cost</b>		<b>R1 169 442.00</b>	<b>R1 070 472</b>	

Inflation provision of 10% to be considered (Material Price Excl. VAT)


**Funding of material and labour for installation of CCTV camera system:**

It is recommended that a budget amount of **R1 200 000** be allocated to the purchase of material and installation for the Security Surveillance System Upgrade Project. The funds to be sourced from the **investment account** so as to relieve the HOA members of the burden of increased monthly fees.

**Impact of the maintenance and monitoring services on the levies:**

<b>Description</b>	<b>Total cost per project (VAT Incl.)</b>	<b>Contribution per unit</b>
Monthly Fee for Maintenance and Monitoring Services for Security Surveillance System	R35 662.65	R100.46


## NNEXURE A: Summary of the Submissions

AMBERFIELD VALLEY ESTATE SECURITY SURVEILLANCE UPGRADE PROJECT												
												
Category	Description	DDL Security Services (Pty) Ltd	Bhekabantu Security Services	CSG Security	No Limited Projects (Pty)Ltd	PC Maiacs	Presak Enterprise	Bidvest Protea Coin	Remote Off-Site Monitoring	Tokiso Security	Vispro	RP Electrical and Pools Construction
Documentation	Registration certificate	Yes	No	Yes		No	Yes	Yes	No	Yes	Yes	Yes
Documentation	Declaration letter signed by duly authorised signatory	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	Yes	No
Documentation	B-BBEE Certificate or Sworn Affidavit (issued by an approved IRBA registered auditor or a SANAS accredited verification agency)	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	No (Signed Affidavit)	Yes
Documentation	Level	2	No	2	No	No	1	2	No	No	No	1
Documentation	SARS Tax Clearance Certificate (TCC) that is valid at the RFI Closing Date and Time	Yes	No	Yes	No	No	Yes	Yes	No	No	No	No
Technical Requirement	Closed-Circuit Television ("CCTV") cameras solution	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes	Yes (Basic Solution)
Technical Requirement	Improvements of the electric fence solution	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No
Technical Requirement	Improvement of the perimeter lighting solution	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	Yes	No

Costing	Closed-Circuit Television ("CCTV") cameras costing (Ownership Option)	R533 457,83	No	R1 902 365,65	R3 473 446,18	R2 924 530,48	R2 071 162,68	No	R1 512 937,53	R734 982,00	R2 184 220,30	R170 614,00
Costing	Closed-Circuit Television ("CCTV") cameras costing (Rental Option)	No	R69 602,61	R54 591,28	No	R84 466,00	No	No	No	R64 527,29	No	No
Costing	Closed-Circuit Television ("CCTV") cameras costing (Maintenance)	R29 698,00	Included on the contract amount	R31 764,15	No	No	No	No	R6 500,00		No	No
Costing	Improvements of the electric fence costing	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	R527 449,80	No
Costing	Improvement of the perimeter lighting costing	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	No	R913 371,40	No
General	Other Comments	Other options: Smart Surveillance Solution: R463876,3 7 (Opex) and Internet: R4 454,76		Additional Costs: Monthly monitoring: R20 682,00 - R73 398,00	No additional documents provided	Additional Costs: Monthly monitoring: R33, 350,00 (Including R7 500 once off setup cost) Additional rental option wireless: 98547	Costing not provided		Pricing Excludes Tax	Maintenance of R29 080 included on R64 527,29	Solar System CCTV: R2153932,7 5 Solar Flood lights: 995169,75 Costs includes maintenance	Basic Solution

NB: Documentation for the proposals received is available on request

## ANNEXURE B: Evaluation Results

AMBERFIELD VALLEY ESTATE SECURITY SURVEILLANCE UPGRADE PROJECT																								
																								
CCTV																								
Index used	10																							
Criteria	Index /10	Weighting	DDL Security Services (Pty) Ltd		Bhekabantu Security Services		CSG Security		No Limited Projects (Pty)Ltd		PC Maniacs		Presak Enterprise		Bidvest Protea Coin		Remote Off-Site Monitoring		Tokiso Security		Vispro		RP Electrical and Pools Construction	
			Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score	Score	Weighted Score
Monitoring (Onsite and offsite)	8	0,16	7	1,12	5	0,8	10	1,6	0	0	3	0,48	4	0,64	3	0,48	0	0	3	0,48	0	0	0	0
Maintenance	8	0,16	4	0,64	3	0,48	8	1,28	0	0	0	0	3	0,48	0	0	3	0,48	3	0,48	3	0,48	0	0
Coverage	10	0,2	6	1,2	8	1,6	10	2	5	1	4	0,8	10	2	8	1,6	7	1,4	8	1,6	5	1	2	0,4
Technology	8	0,16	8	1,28	8	1,28	10	1,6	8	1,28	5	0,8	8	1,28	6	0,96	7	1,12	10	1,6	6	0,96	2	0,32
System Availability (Power)	10	0,2	2	0,4	0	0	2	0,4	6	1,2	0	0	2	0,4	5	1	8	1,6	8	1,6	0	0	0	0
Compatibility (Integration to the existing system)	6	0,12	0	0	0	0	4	0,48	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
<b>Total</b>	<b>50</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>27</b>	<b>4,64</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>4,16</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>7,36</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>3,48</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>2,08</b>	<b>27</b>	<b>4,8</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>4,04</b>	<b>25</b>	<b>4,6</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>5,76</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>2,44</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>0,72</b>
BEE (Level 1 - 10, 2 = 8 and None = 0)		0,1	8	0,8	0	0	8	0,8	0	0	0	0	10	1	8	0,8	0	0	0	0	0	0	10	1
Price (R3m = mean, standard deviation cap)		0,2	9	1,8	7	1,4	10	2	5	1	3	0,6	5	1	0	0	9	1,8	6	1,2	7	1,4	8	1,6
Functionality		0,7	4,64	3,248	4,16	2,912	7,36	5,152	3,48	2,436	2,08	1,456	4,8	3,36	4,0	2,828	4,6	3,22	5,76	4,032	2,44	1,708	0,72	0,504
Total Price			R2 800 000	R3 700 000	R3 000 000	R4 400 000	R5 300 000	#####	#####	R0	R2 900 000	R1 800 000	R3 900 000	R2 500 000										
Grand total CCTV			21,64	5,848	11,16	4,312	25,36	7,952	8,48	3,436	5,08	2,056	19,8	5,360	12,04	3,628	13,6	5,02	11,76	5,232	9,44	3,108	18,72	3,104
Ranking			2	6	1	8	11	3	7	5	4	9	10											



**ANNEXURE C: Proposals from Suppliers**

**(Available on Request)**